WELCOME!



GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals Method Introduction for NGOs

July 12, 2016

Presenters today

Shari Franjevic Education and Training Leader <u>shari@cleanproduction.org</u>



Bev Thorpe Networks and Advocacy bev@cleanproduction.org





Part 1 (July 12) – The GreenScreen Method

- The value of chemical hazard assessment and origins of GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals
- 2. How GreenScreen 'works': how it assesses chemical hazards and how it benchmarks chemicals
- 3. How do I get a chemical assessed and where do I find GreenScreen reports?
- 4. The GreenScreen List Translator and ChemHAT: online tools to quickly identify chemicals of concern
- 5. Response of American Chemistry Council to GreenScreen
- 6. Q&A



Part 2 (July 14) – Applications

Ways in which GreenScreen is being applied:

- Government regulations
- Companies' use in alternatives assessment for safer materials
- Integration into certification and standards
- Campaigners' use of GreenScreen
 - Women's Voices for the Earth
 - Breast Cancer Fund/Cans Not Cancer campaign
 - Natural Resources Defense Council and Coming Clean
- Q&A

How GreenScreen promotes Green Chemistry

- 1. The value of chemical hazard assessment and origins of GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals
- 2. How GreenScreen 'works': how it assesses chemical hazards and how it benchmarks chemicals
- 3. How do I get a chemical assessed and where do I find GreenScreen reports?
- 4. The GreenScreen List Translator and ChemHAT: online tools to quickly identify chemicals of concern
- 5. Response of American Chemistry Council to GreenScreen
- 6. Q&A

GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals



- Is a leading chemical hazard assessment tool that was launched by Clean Production Action in 2007
- It provides a roadmap to green chemistry through five benchmarks
- It drives continuous improvement and innovation to safer chemical use
- The method is publicly available, open and transparent

http://www.greenscreenchemicals.org/

GreenScreen is grounded in key Principles of Green Chemistry: it examines the inherent hazards of chemicals

Green chemistry is "the utilization of a set of principles that **reduces the use or generation of hazardous substances** in the design, manufacture and application of chemical products. "



#3. Less hazardous chemical syntheses

#4. Design safer chemicals and products

#5 Use safer solvents and auxiliaries

#10. Design chemicals and products to degrade after use

#12. Minimize the potential for accidents

GreenScreen is not a Risk Assessment tool Risk Assessment considers both hazard and exposure.

You can attempt to reduce impacts of a hazardous chemical by controlling or limiting exposure to it by using:

- engineering controls (e.g., vents),
- administrative controls (e.g., limit working hours) and/or
- personal protective equipment (e.g., face masks)

OR you can find inherently safer chemical substitutes

It is better to first reduce or eliminate the hazards of a chemical to reduce risk to people and the environment

Risk is a function of hazard and exposure





Reduce Hazard as a Priority

HP values this inherent hazard approach - used GreenScreen to replace PVC cables and chlorinated/brominated flame retardants

"A basic premise of Green Chemistry is that chemical risk is most effectively managed by reducing hazards because exposure controls can and do fail, products are used in unintended ways and end-of-life management of obsolete equipment is often problematic."

> -H.A. Holder, P.H. Mazurkiewick, C.D. Robertson, C.A. Wray. Hewlett-Packard's Use of the GreenScreen® for Safer Chemicals. Chemical Alternatives Assessments. Royal Society of Chemistry Publishing. 2013

E-waste end of life fate and dioxin generation is a global concern (POPs)



GreenScreen was launched as campaign support to Deca-BDE controversy (2007)



- Brominated flame retardants (PBDEs) were a major campaign focus
- States were drafting PBDE bills
- Deca-BDE controversy in European Union (bromine industry tried to de-list it from RoHS Directive)
- Bromine industry defending and promoting new halogenated flame retardants



Furniture Flame Retardancy Partn Environmental Profiles of Chemical Flame-Alternatives for Low-I

At this time EPA's Design for Environment program was assessing flame retardants in furniture and had developed a hazard assessment method but there a need for easier decision logic!

11



https://www.epa.gov/saferchoice/flame-retardants-used-flexible-polyurethane-foam

Clean Production Action enhanced EPA's Design for the Environment approach, introduced a benchmarking method, and then evaluated common flame retardants in TV casings



http://www.greenscreenchemicals.org/resources/entry/greenscreen-evaluating-flame-retardants-for-tv-enclosures



Hazard assessment of Deca BDE and another flame retardant used in TV casings resulted in Benchmark 1 outcomes – while RDP was found to be Benchmark 2

Chemical	Reason for Benchmark	Final Benchmark
DecaBDE and its breakdown products	Breakdown products: • pentaBDE = PBT, vPvB, vPT, vBT, + H- endocrine Benchmarks 1(a),(b),(c) • octaBDE = vPT + H-developmental Benchmark 1(c)	Benchmark 1: Avoid - Chemical of High Concern
BPADP (or BAPP) and its breakdown products	Breakdown product (and formulation contaminant): bisphenol A high concern for endocrine disruption Benchmark 1(d)	Benchmark 1: Avoid - Chemical of High Concern
RDP and its breakdown products	 <u>Chemical constituents</u>: high persistence or bioaccumulation and moderate or high toxicity (but not for priority effects) Benchmarks 2(a), 2(c) <u>Breakdown product</u>: <i>phenol</i> high toxicity (but not for priority effects) Benchmark 2(d) 	Benchmark 2: Use <u>but</u> Search for Safer Substitutes

- The availability of a comparatively safer alternative helped states pass Deca-BDE phase out bills
- Great! But it's still only a BM-2 (Use but Search for Safer Alternatives)
- So are there even safer alternatives?

From what we know, about 20% of chemicals assessed using GreenScreen are classified as Benchmark 1; almost half of chemicals screened are Benchmark 2.





The Screening Method

- 1. The value of chemical hazard assessment and origins of GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals
- 2. How GreenScreen 'works': how GS assesses chemical hazards and how it benchmarks chemicals
- 3. How do I get a chemical assessed and where do I find GreenScreen reports?
- 4. The GreenScreen List Translator and ChemHAT: online tools to quickly identify chemicals of concern
- 5. Response of American Chemistry Council to GreenScreen
- 6. Q&A

The GreenScreen procedure

1. Assess and classify hazards

				Fi	gure	1: G	reenScr	een®	Hazar	d Ra	tings	for	Pro	pyle	ne G	Hyce	ol		
	Gree	φIH	uman				Group II and II* Human								tox	- Fe	ate	Phys	sical
с	м	R	D	Е	AT		st		N	SnS*	SaR*	hs	hE	АА	CA	P	в	Rx	F
						single	repeated*	single	repeated*										
L	L.	м	м	DG	L	DG	м	м	DG	L.	DG	L	L	L	L	vi.	u.	L	L

2. Assign a Benchmark score



3. Make informed decisions

GreenScreen assesses the hazard of a chemical against 18 Endpoints or categories

Human Health Group I	Human Health Group II and II*	Environmental Toxicity & Fate	Physical Hazards
Carcinogenicity	Acute Toxicity	Acute Aquatic Toxicity	Reactivity
Mutagenicity & Genotoxicity	Systemic Toxicity & Organ Effects	Chronic Aquatic Toxicity	Flammability
Reproductive Toxicity	Neurotoxicity	Other Ecotoxicity Studies when available	
Developmental	Skin Sensitization	Persistence	
Toxicity	Respiratory Sensitization		
Endocrine Activity	Skin Irritation	Bioaccumulation	
	Eye Irritation		

How GreenScreen assesses Endocrine Activity (E) of a chemical

- Endocrine activity (E): A change in endocrine homeostasis which may include binding to or altering cell receptors, altering hormone signaling in cells, altering hormone levels, or disrupting hormonally-regulated processes.
- Any evidence of (E) is given an initial hazard assessment of Moderate
- Good evidence of reproductive or developmental toxicity is given a hazard classification of High



Example of a Completed GreenScreen Hazard Summary Table

						G	reenS	creer	n Haza	rd Su	mmar	y Tab	le						
	Grou	p I Hu	ıman				Gro	up II	and II	* Hun	nan			Eco	tox	Fa	te	Phy	sical
Carcinogenicity	Mutagenicity	Reproductive Toxicity	Developmental Toxicity	Endocrine Activity	Acute Toxicity		systemic loxicity		Neurotoxicity	Skin Sensitization*	Respiratory Sensitization*	Skin Irritation	Eye Irritation	Acute Aquatic Toxicity	Chronic Aquatic Toxicity	Persistence	Bioaccumulation	Reactivity	Flammability
						single	repeated	single	repeated *	*	*								
L	L	L	М	М	L	L	L	vH	Н	L	DG	L	L	н	Н	vL	L	м	L

These hazard assessment tables are a useful way to summarize chemical hazards



WHEN THE WIND BLOWS

TRACKING TOXIC CHEMICALS IN GAS FIELDS AND IMPACTED COMMUNITIES

- 14 GreenScreen hazard assessment tables featured in recent Coming Clean report
- <u>http://comingcleaninc.org/wind-</u> <u>blows</u>





Benzene was assigned a **Benchmark Score of 1** ("Avoid—Chemical of High Concern") as it has High Group 1 Human Toxicity (High carcinogenicity (C), mutagenicity (M), reproductive toxicity (R), and developmental toxicity (D)). This corresponds to GreenScreen® benchmark classification 1e in CPA 2011. There are no data gaps.

	Grou	p I Hı	uman				G	roup II ar	nd II* Hui	man				Eco	otox	Fa	nte	Phys	sical
С	М	R	D	E	AT	S	т	1	N	SnS*	SnR*	IrS	IrE	AA	CA	Р	В	Rx	F
						SINGLE	REPEATED*	SINGLE	REPEATED*										
н	н	н	н	М	L.	vH	н	м	н	L.	L	н	н	н	н	vL	vL	L	н

Let's look in a bit more detail about how a GreenScreen Assessment is done



2. Assign a Benchmark score

3. Make informed decisions

To Begin: <u>Identify</u> chemical ingredients and their environmental transformation products (breakdown products) as well

GreenScreen Hazard Sum	imary	/ Tabl	le															
						Human	Hea	lth Ef	fects				Eco	tox.	Fa	te	P-C	nem
			F	Priorit	y Eff	ects				Ē	L L							
Chemical	CAS #	Carcinogenic	Mutagenic	Reproductive	Developmental	Endocrine Disruption	Neurological	Acute Toxicity	Systemic/Organ Effects	Sensitization (ski or respiratory)	Irritation/Corrosic (skin or eyes)	Immune System	Acute	Chronic	Persistence	Bioaccumulation	Exposivity	Flammability
Chemical Formulation X																		
Chemical Constitutent A																		
Chemical Constitutent B																		
Chemical Constitutent C																		
Transformation Products																		
Transformation Product Y																		
Combustion Byproduct Z																		
Biodegradation product V																		

Once chemical ingredients are identified and listed, then Assess & Classify each chemical's Hazards



2) RESEARCH

Research & collect data.

3) CLASSIFY

4) CONFIDENCE

5) DOCUMENT

Assess & Classify Hazards



Based on information collected, next assign a hazard level for each of the 18 endpoints

Example: here's how a chemical is given a hazard score for carcinogenicity

Example – Hazard Criteria for Carcinogenicity (C)

FIGURE 2. Hazard Criteria for Carcinogenicity and Mutagenicity

	Information Type	Information Source	List Type	High (H)	Moderate (M)	Low (L)
	Data	GHS Criteria & Guidance		GHS Category 1A (Known) or 1B (Presumed) for any route of exposure	GHS Category 2 (Suspected) for any route of exposure or limited or marginal evidence of carcinoge- nicity in animals (See Guidance)	Adequate data available, and negative studies, no structural alerts, and GHS not classified.
	A Lists	US EPA - IRIS Carcinogens (1986)	Authoritative	Group A, B1 or B2	Group C	Group E
		US EPA - IRIS Carcinogens (1996, 1999, 2005)	Authoritative	Known or Likely		Not Likely
		EU - REACH Annex XVII CMRs	Authoritative	Category 1 or 2	Category 3	
		EU - Annex VI CMRs	Authoritative	Carc 1A or 1B	Carc 2	
6		EU - GHS (H-Statements)	Authoritative	H350 or H350i	H351	
N.		EU - R-Phrases	Authoritative	R45 or R49	R40	
licit		EU – SVHC Authorisation List	Authoritative	Carcinogenic - Banned unless Authorised		
arcinoger		"GHS - [COUNTRY]* Lists (*Australia, the European Union, Indonesia, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, New Zealand, Taiwan and Thailand)"	Screening	Category 1A or 1B	Category 2	Not Classified
ö		IARC	Authoritative	Group 1 or 2a	Group 2b	Group 4
		МАК	Authoritative	Carcinogen Group 1 or 2	Carcinogen Group 3A or 3B, 4, or 5	
		US CDC - Occupational Carcinogens	Authoritative	Occupational Carcinogen		
		US NIH - Report on Carcinogens	Authoritative	Known or Reasonably Anticipated		
		CA EPA Prop 65	Authoritative	Carcinogen		
	B Lists	US EPA - IRIS Carcinogens (1986)	Authoritative	Group D		
		US EPA - IRIS Carcinogens (1999)	Authoritative	Suggestive Evidence, but not sufficient to assess	s human carcinogenic potential	
		US EPA - IRIS Carcinogens (2005)	Authoritative	Suggestive evidence of carcinogenic potential		
		IARC	Authoritative	Group 3		
		CA EPA - Prop 65 (with qualifications)*	Authoritative	Carcinogen - specific to chemical form or expos	ure <mark>route</mark>	

GreenScreen makes any data gap transparent

						G	reenS	creer	n Haza	rd Su	mmar	y Tab	le						
	Grou	p I Hu	ıman				Gro	up II	and II [*]	* Hun	nan			Eco	tox	Fa	te	Phys	sical
Carcinogenicity	Mutagenicity	Reproductive Toxicity	Developmental Toxicity	Endocrine Activity	Acute Toxicity		systemic loxicity		Neurotoxicity	Skin Sensitization*	Respiratory Sensitization*	Skin Irritation	Eye Irritation	Acute Aquatic Toxicity	Chronic Aquatic Toxicity	Persistence	Bioaccumulation	Reactivity	Flammability
						single	repeated	single	repeated	*									
L	L	L	М	М	L	L	L	vH	н	L	DG	L	L	Н	Н	vL	L	М	L

GreenScreen Hazard Summary Table clearly distinguishes unknown hazards

DG

Each hazard 'score' will also show the level of confidence for that designation

							Gre	en Sc	reen H	lazar	d Rati	ngs							
	Grou	p I Hu	ıman				Gro	up II	and II	* Hun	nan			Eco	tox	Fa	te	Phy	sical
Carcinogenicity	Mutagenicity	Reproductive Toxicity	Developmental Toxicity	Endocrine Activity	Acute Toxicity		systemic loxicity		Neurotoxicity	Skin Sensitization*	Respiratory Sensitization*	Skin Irritation	Eye Irritation	Acute Aquatic Toxicity	Chronic Aquatic Toxicity	Persistence	Bioaccumulation	Reactivity	Flammability
						single	repeated	single	repeated *	*	*								
L	L	L	М	М	L	L	L	vH	Н	L	DG	L	L	Н	Н	vL	L	М	L

Level of Confidence:

- Bold = High confidence
- Italics = Low confidence

Once the hazard levels are assigned for each endpoint and a hazard table is filled out for that chemical, you...

1. Assess and classify hazards



3. Make informed decisions

Apply Benchmark Criteria

GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals v1.3 GreenScreen Benchmarks™





Copyright © (2014–2016) by Clean Production Action, All rights reserved.

Avoid—Chemical of High Concern

Example: Benchmark 1 has five criteria against which a chemical's hazards are compared; if any of these criteria are met then that chemical is a Benchmark 1 chemical



- a. <u>**PBT</u>** = high Persistence + high Bioaccumulation + high Toxicity</u>
- b. <u>**vPvB**</u> = very Persistent + very Bioaccumulative
- c., d.<u>vPT</u> or <u>vBT</u> = (very Persistent or very

Bioaccumulative) + Toxic

e. **<u>high Human Toxicity</u>** for any "priority effect"

Assign a Benchmark Score



1) Apply Benchmark Criteria

Benchmark U Unspecified due to insufficient data 2)

Analyze Data Gaps and any information on a chemical's transformation products

Before assigning a final Benchmark score it is important to analyze the data gaps and transformation products of that chemical. A chemical's preliminary benchmark score might be modified because of its type and number of **Data Gaps**

	Grou	p I Hı	ıman				Gr	oup II an	nd II* Hu	man				Eco	otox	F	ate	Phy	sical
C	м	р		Б	АТ	S	T	1	N	CC*	SD*	TC	I.T.F			р	р	Der	F
C	IVI	ĸ	D	E	AI	single	repeat*	single	repeat*	515*	SUK*	115	ILE	AA	CA	P	Б	KX	r
L	L	L	DG	DG	L	М	М	L	L	L	DG	L	М	L	L	М	L	L	М







A chemical's preliminary benchmark score might be modified because of its **transformation products**



Deca-BDE is assigned a Preliminary Benchmark 2 score but consideration of its transformation products results in a final Benchmark 1 score

How does GreenScreen assess Mixtures & Products?



GreenScreen: Mixtures & Products Results and Reporting Requirements

No overall Benchmark score

Promotes transparency

Each ingredient: Chemical name and CAS# Each ingredient: Benchmark score

Product: % at each Benchmark

Chemical	CAS	% by weight	Benchmark	Benchmark by %
Calcium carbonate	1317-65-3	34%	4	34%
Acetone	67-64-1	20%	2	20%
Petroleum distillates	64742-89-8	20%	1	
Toluene	108-88-3	20%	1	
Dichloromethane	75-09-2	5%	1	46%
Methyl ethyl ketone	78-93-3	1%	1	

Once the final Benchmark score is decided, you...

1. Assess and classify hazards

2. Assign a Benchmark score



Make Informed decisions

- Some data gaps might not be acceptable on a case-by-case basis based on known product use and expected routes of exposure.
- e.g., While lack of data on *skin irritation* may be sufficient to achieve a *Benchmark 3*, it would not be an acceptable data gap when selecting a chemical for use in a *skin lotion*.



GreenScreen reports

- 1. The value of chemical hazard assessment and origins of GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals
- 2. How GreenScreen 'works': how it assesses chemical hazards and how it benchmarks chemicals
- 3. How do I get a chemical assessed and where do I find GreenScreen reports?
- 4. The GreenScreen List Translator and ChemHAT: online tools to quickly identify chemicals of concern
- 5. Response of American Chemistry Council to GreenScreen
- 6. Q&A

You can hire a Licensed GreenScreen Profiler

http://www.greenscreenchemicals.org/professionals/profilers



Download Certified Assessments from the GreenScreen Store

http://www.greenscreenchemicals.org/gs-assessments/chemicals



The GreenScreen List Translator

- 1. The value of chemical hazard assessment and origins of GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals
- 2. How GreenScreen 'works': how it assesses chemical hazards and how it benchmarks chemicals
- 3. How do I get a chemical assessed and where do I find GreenScreen reports?
- 4. The GreenScreen List Translator and ChemHAT: online tools to quickly identify chemicals of concern
- 5. Response of the American Chemistry Council to GreenScreen
- 6. Q&A

The Green Screen List Translator – a quick way to identify chemicals of high concern



- The List Translator is a great way to quickly identify and prioritize action on chemicals of high concern
- It assesses a chemical's hazards using list-based information only
- The absence of a chemical on a list does not mean that a chemical is safe!

- **LT-1**: 'Likely to be a GreenScreen Benchmark 1'
- **LT-P1:** 'Possibly a GS Benchmark 1 because it is on screening lists only; its presence on different lists may have a range of different hazard scores; further research is needed
- **LT-UNK:** information provided is insufficient to determine this chemical's hazards; further research is needed

http://www.greenscreenchemicals.org/method/greenscreen-list-translator

GreenScreen Tools Comparison

Attribute	GreenScreen	GreenScreen List Translator
*Score	GreenScreen Benchmark	List Translator
Expertise	Significant	Minimal
Time	Significant	Minimal
Identifies	Safer Hazardous Poorly understood	Hazardous
Analysis	Measured Data Estimated Data Lists	Lists
Transformation Products	Yes	No
Data gaps	Yes	No

*A Benchmark score always trumps a List Translator score.





Healthy Building Network's Pharos tool has automated the GreenScreen List Translator

www.pharosproject.net







PERKINS + WILL



Search for a chemical to see its LT score then select Hazard Tab for more list-based hazard info



Another on-line (free) tool: Chemhat.org Builds on Pharos framework





- 1. The value of chemical hazard assessment and origins of GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals
- 2. How GreenScreen 'works': how it assesses chemical hazards and how it benchmarks chemicals
- 3. How do I get a chemical assessed and where do I find GreenScreen reports?
- 4. The GreenScreen List Translator and ChemHAT: online tools to quickly identify chemicals of concern
- 5. Response of the American Chemistry Council to GreenScreen
- 6. Q&A

The American Chemistry Council's position on GreenScreen



November 14, 2014

ACC'S VALUE CHAIN OUTREACH INITIATIVE

VINYL INSTITUTE ANNUAL MEETING





ACC watching market de-selection of chemicals



ACC strategy:

Tools: Debunk Hazard-only Approach; Promote Alternatives

Hazard Tools Assessed **Chemicals Analyzed** Q1 2015 Headline GreenSuite Caffeine Monitor, Measure, Report, Reward, Citric Acid Hazard-only tools fail Greenv to provide éasy answers...Generate Ethylene Glycol **A Formulation Profiling Tool** inconsistent, non-discriminatory results tor the E **Glycolic Acid** nesign Dibutyl Phthalate U.S. EPA Benzios-thiaxolinone SciVera Hexabromo-cyclododecane Better Science, Better Products.

Advocate government use of consensus & choice in sustainability dovernment adoption of private sustainability standards Shine a

light on standards' Veikilotites consensus/ green marketing

> Engage in standards development

Proliferation of private "sustainability" standards

Walmar

KAISER PERMANENTE

CLEAN PRODUCTION

No confidence in

chemical regulation

TSCA Reform/RC Product Safety Code

> **Public interest** group antichemical pressure Engage directly with retailers, corporate influencers, associations, activist groups Easy to use red lists

Menu of science & risk-based solutions

Thank You! Questions?

- The value of chemical hazard assessment and origins of GreenScreen[®] for Safer Chemicals
- 2. How GreenScreen 'works': how it assesses chemical hazards and how it benchmarks chemicals
- 3. How do I get a chemical assessed and where do I find GreenScreen reports?
- 4. The GreenScreen List Translator: an online tool to quickly identify chemicals of concern
- 5. Response of American Chemistry Council to GreenScreen
- 6. Q&A